

PROJECTS SUB (POLICY AND RESOURCES) COMMITTEE

Wednesday, 10 May 2017

**Minutes of the meeting of the Projects Sub (Policy and Resources) Committee
held at the Guildhall EC2 at 1.45 pm**

Present

Members:

Sir Michael Snyder (Chairman)
Hugh Morris (Deputy Chairman)
Deputy Keith Bottomley
Karina Dostalova
Marianne Fredericks

Christopher Hayward
Deputy Jamie Ingham Clark
Deputy Catherine McGuinness
Deputy John Tomlinson
James Tumbridge

Officers:

Peter Lisley	- Town Clerk's Department
Chris Braithwaite	- Town Clerk's Department
Jennifer Ogunleye	- Town Clerk's Department
Arshi Zaman	- Town Clerk's Department
Sean Green	- Chamberlain's Department
Philip Gregory	- Chamberlain's Department
Mark Jarvis	- Chamberlain's Department
Mona Lewis	- Chamberlain's Department
Kevin Mulcahy	- Chamberlain's Department
Steven Bage	- City Surveyor
Mark Lowman	- City Surveyor's Department
Melanie Charalambous	- Department of the Built Environment
Leila Ben-Hassel	- Community and Children's Services Department
Sarah Greenwood	- Community and Children's Services Department
Davina Lilley	- Community and Children's Services Department
Mike Saunders	- Community and Children's Services Department
Gary Brailsford-Hart	- City of London Police
Commander Richard Woolford	- City of London Police
Martin Rodman	- Superintendent, West Ham Park and City Gardens
Christopher Earlie	- Open Spaces Department
Richard O'Callaghan	- Barbican Centre
Jonathan Poyner	- Barbican Centre
Hannah Bibbins	- Guildhall School of Music and Drama

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies for absence were received from Nick Bensted-Smith and Mark Boleat.

2. **MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**

Deputy Jamie Ingham Clark declared a non-pecuniary interest in relation to item 34 by virtue of being a church warden for St Lawrence Jewry.

Deputy Catherine McGuinness declared a non-pecuniary interest in relation to item 31 by virtue of being a Member and Trustee of the City of London Academy Trust.

Christopher Hayward declared a non-pecuniary interest in relation to item 31 by virtue of being a Trustee of the City of London Academy Trust.

3. **MINUTES**

RESOLVED – That the public minutes and summary of the meeting held on 17 February 2017 are approved as an accurate record.

4. **APPOINTMENT OF CO-OPTED MEMBERS**

RESOLVED – That Karina Dostalova, Marianne Fredericks, John Tomlinson and James Tumbridge are elected to the Sub-Committee as co-opted Members.

The Chairman thanked all Members for putting themselves forward for co-option and invited all Members to remain for and contribute to the meeting.

5. **TERMS OF REFERENCE**

The Sub-Committee considered a report of the Town Clerk which set out the Sub-Committee's Terms of Reference.

The Town Clerk explained that, following a discussion with the Chairman, it had been agreed that there was some ambiguity in the entry in the Terms of Reference which stated that the Sub-Committee was responsible for:

- "Overseeing the City Corporation's programme of projects, excluding those within the remit of the Corporate Asset Sub-Committee, to ensure their delivery within the parameters set by the Resource Allocation Sub-Committee";

The Town Clerk explained that the Corporate Asset Sub-Committee acted as the Service Committee for some projects, and those projects were not excluded from the remit of the Projects Sub-Committee. This entry in the Terms of Reference referred to the responsibility of the Corporate Asset Sub-Committee for overseeing the delivery of the programme of minor repairs and maintenance works set out within the Cyclical Works Programme (CWP) (previously known as the Additional Works Programme (AWP)). The Projects Sub-Committee did have the authority to call-in works from the CWP to assure itself that these works were being delivered in an appropriate manner.

The Town Clerk suggested that the Terms of Reference could be made clearer by amending this entry to read:

- "Overseeing the City Corporation's programme of projects, excluding those within the Cyclical Works Programme (although these may be called-in by

the Projects Sub-Committee), to ensure their delivery within the parameters set by the Resource Allocation Sub-Committee”;

The Sub-Committee agreed that this amendment to the Terms of Reference should be proposed to the Policy and Resources Committee.

In relation to the call-in of works within the CWP and AWP, the Chairman explained that he had recently received the list of works to consider which should be called-in. He explained that he had requested some investigation of some works undertaken by the Guildhall School of Music and Drama and the Barbican Centre. He had been satisfied with the information provided by the Guildhall School of Music and Drama, but had been informed of one instance of a Barbican Centre project which had been valued in excess of £250,000 and therefore should have progressed through the Projects procedure.

The Chairman also explained that he had identified some groups of works which it appeared had been broken up into individual work streams to ensure that they were under the £250,000 threshold for the Projects procedure.

The Chairman also explained that there were a large number of instances where, response to queries regarding ensuring value for money, the response had been that the work was procured through City Procurement. He explained that this was not sufficient evidence to indicate that value for money had been achieved, and therefore Member oversight was required.

The Chairman indicated that he had requested that the Town Clerk and City Surveyor provide a report regarding the CWP and AWP works which he had called-in.

RESOLVED – That the Sub-Committee

- a) requests that the Policy and Resources Committee amend the Sub-Committee’s Terms of Reference to read:
 - “Overseeing the City Corporation’s programme of projects, excluding those within the Cyclical Works Programme (although these may be called-in by the Projects Sub-Committee), to ensure their delivery within the parameters set by the Resource Allocation Sub-Committee.”
- b) requests that the Town Clerk and City Surveyor provide a report regarding the called-in CWP and AWP works.

6. **GATEWAY APPROVAL PROCESS**

RESOLVED – That the Sub-Committee notes the Gateway Approval Process.

7. **DECENT HOMES WORKS TO PROPERTIES PREVIOUSLY OMITTED FROM PROGRAMMES (CALL-BACKS 2017-2020) - GATEWAY 3/4 OPTIONS APPRAISAL**

The Sub-Committee considered a report of the Director of Community and Children’s Services which set out the options and sought approval to develop the preferred option for the project to complete Decent Homes works to properties previously omitted from programmes. The preferred option was to enter in to a fixed-budget term contract, comprised of an agreed schedule of

rates to carry out the call-backs, as this approach had worked well in the recent past.

In relation to this and other reports included within the agenda, the Chairman commented that the reports contained lots of assertions that were not supported by evidence. He noted that this report stated that there was only one practicable option for the project, but did not give sufficient explanation to support this. He also commented that, even if there was only one option to proceed with the project, there should be a range of options in relation to procurement options to provide innovative and efficient ways of delivering that option.

The Chairman noted that there had been an increasing trend, in recent months, of the role of City Procurement being to provide assurance that all processes were properly followed, rather than to provide innovative procurement approaches to deliver best value.

The Committee endorsed the Chairman's comment.

A Member noted that the Procurement report for this project included staff costs and fees within the budget for the procurement and asked whether this was correct. The Chamberlain confirmed that it was not correct and the total contract value was £500,000.

RESOLVED – That the Sub-Committee:

- a) Approves Option 1 for proceeding to Procurement and Gateway 5.
- b) Notes that the estimated total project budget of £575,000.
- c) Approves a budget of £5,000 to reach the next Gateway.

8. DECENT HOMES WORKS TO AVONDALE SQUARE ESTATE (PHASE II) - GATEWAY 3/4 OPTIONS APPRAISAL

The Sub-Committee considered a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services which set out the options and sought approval to develop the preferred option for the project to deliver Decent Homes works to the Avondale Square Estate. The preferred option was to procure a principal contractor to complete a planned programme of the necessary works to replace kitchens, bathrooms and central heating systems at the identified properties.

A Member noted that the per unit costs for this project were 50% higher than for the project in the previous report and asked for the reason for this. The Director of Community and Children's Services explained that the previous project was mainly focused on providing upgrades from kitchens and bathrooms, while this project also included providing upgrades to central heating.

RESOLVED – That the Sub-Committee:

- a) Approves Option 1, a structured programme of Decent Homes works to 74 flats on the Avondale Square Estate, to proceed to Procurement and Gateway 5.

- b) Notes the estimated total project budget of £1,035,000.
- c) Approves a budget of £7,000 to reach the next Gateway.

9. **CONCRETE REPAIRS TO CULLUM WELCH HOUSE - GATEWAY 4 DETAILED OPTIONS APPRAISAL**

The Sub-Committee considered a report of the Director of the Director of Community and Children's Services which sought approval to develop the preferred option for the project for concrete repairs at Cullum Welch House. The preferred option was to replace concrete balustrades to the north elevation, patch repairs to concrete staircases, beams, slab ends and patch repair and recoating of the pre-cast concrete planters and pot holders on the south elevation.

The Chairman commented that the fees and staff costs for the project were very high and asked the Sub-Committee to agree that authority to determine the report be delegated to the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman, subject to information being provided as to how the fees and staff costs would be reduced.

A Member noted that the Procurement form provided to the Committee had not been signed off and queried whether it had been approved. He also noted that the form indicated a start date, but no finish date. The Chamberlain confirmed that the form had been approved and that information regarding the finish date would be provided to the Chairman and Deputy Chairman as part of the delegated authority decision.

RESOLVED – That the Sub-Committee delegates authority to the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman, to determine the report.

10. **REFURBISHMENT OF TOWER BRIDGE ENGINE ROOMS INTERNAL RECEPTION AND GIFT SHOP - GATEWAY 7 OUTCOME REPORT**

The Sub-Committee considered a report of the Director of Open Spaces which provided information of the outcomes from the project to refurbish and reconfiguration of the engine room's internal reception and gift shop.

A Member asked for clarification whether the spend to date listed in the report was the final cost of the project. It was confirmed that it was.

The Town Clerk explained that there was currently a significant delay in providing Gateway 7 reports, as it was difficult to provide information of the outcomes of projects which had revenue implications for at least 12-18 months after works had been completed. He explained that, in future, it was intended that an interim Gateway 7 report would be provided once works were completed, with a further project closure report once the outcomes were known.

RESOLVED – That the project be closed.

11. **DEMOLITION OF DISUSED POULTRY SHEDS, WOODREDON ESTATE, EPPING FOREST - GATEWAY 7 OUTCOMES REPORT**

The Sub-Committee considered a report of the City Surveyor which provided information of the outcomes from the project to demolish four disused poultry sheds at Woodredon Estate, Epping.

RESOLVED – That the project be closed.

12. **CORPORATE DISASTER RECOVERY CENTRE - GATEWAY 7 OUTCOME REPORT**

The Sub-Committee considered a report of the Chamberlain which provided information of the outcomes from the project to relocate the City's disaster recovery (DR) site from IBM Harbour Exchange to Logicalis in Slough and additional related services.

The Chairman explained that this was a historic project and, while it ensured that Disaster Recovery capability was improved as a result of this project was improved, further Disaster Recovery risks had been discovered and this remained a risk area.

RESOLVED – That the project be closed.

13. **OPEN MEDIATED WI-FI - GATEWAY 7 OUTCOME REPORT**

The Sub-Committee considered a report of the Chamberlain which provided information of the outcomes from the project to provide a reliable, robust, and appropriately sized public Wi-Fi facility within a number of COLC and COLP premises for the use of business partners, Members and events attendees.

The Chamberlain explained that the final spend for this product was in fact £151,200, rather than £140,700 as stated in the report.

RESOLVED – That the project be closed.

14. **REFURBISHMENT AND MODIFICATION OF ACCOMMODATION SILK STREET - PHASE 1 - GATEWAY 7 OUTCOME REPORT**

The Sub-Committee considered a report of the Principal, Guildhall School of Music and Drama which provided information of the outcomes from the project to modify the Silk Street building to suit the needs of the Music department, following the relocation of much of the Drama department to the Milton Court building.

RESOLVED – That the project be closed.

15. **REFURBISHMENT AND MODIFICATION OF ACCOMMODATION SILK STREET - PHASE 2 2014 - GATEWAY 7 OUTCOME REPORT**

The Sub-Committee considered a report of the Principal, Guildhall School of Music and Drama which provided information of the outcomes from the project for the second phase of the works to modify the Silk Street building, which comprised the completion of work commenced in the summer of 2013

RESOLVED – That the project be closed.

16. QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE

There were no questions.

17. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT

There was one item of urgent business.

Guildhall School of Music and Drama – Fire Alarm

RESOLVED – That the Committee delegates authority to the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman, to consider a report in relation to fire alarm works at the Guildhall School of Music and Drama.

18. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

RESOLVED – That under Section 100(A) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following item(s) on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part I of the Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act.

Item No.	Paragraph No
19-20, 23-35, 37-41	3
21-22, 36	3, 7

19. NON-PUBLIC MINUTES

The Sub-Committee approved the non-public minutes of the meeting held on 17 February 2017 as an accurate record.

20. LESSONS LEARNED THEMES

The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the Town Clerk which summarised the key lessons learned and themes from a review of the Gateway 7 Outcome Reports submitted to Projects Sub Committee over the last three years.

21. SECURITY ENHANCEMENTS CONTEXT

The Sub-Committee noted a joint report of the Town Clerk and City Surveyor which provided context to the current security threat and the necessary enhancements that were required at the City of London Corporation.

22. SECURITY ENHANCEMENTS/SECURITY CROSS CUTTING PROJECTS - GUILDHALL COMPLEX, BARBICAN CENTRE, CENTRAL CRIMINAL COURT & MANSION HOUSE

The Sub-Committee considered and approved a joint report of the Town Clerk and City Surveyor which set out the options and sought approval to develop the preferred option for the Security Enhancements Project and Security Cross Cutting Projects.

23. JOINT NETWORK REFRESH PROGRAMME - LOCAL AREA NETWORK - ISSUES REPORT (GATEWAY 5)

The Sub-Committee noted a report of the Chamberlain which provided Members with an update to the procurement process for the Local Area Network aspect of the Joint Network Refresh Programme.

24. IT TRANSFORMATION PROGRAMME - WIDE AREA NETWORK PROGRESS UPDATE - GATEWAY 6 PROGRESS UPDATE

The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the Chamberlain which provided an update regarding the IT Transformation Wide Area Network project.

25. HOSTEL DEVELOPMENT & LODGE LL (MIDDLE STREET) ENABLING PROJECT - ISSUES REPORT (GATEWAY 4/5)

The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services which sought approval for the release of funding for the Hostel Development & Lodge II (Middle Street) enabling Project.

26. GOLDEN LANE PLAYGROUND REFURBISHMENT - GATEWAY 5 AUTHORITY TO START WORK

The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services which sought approval to commence works on the Golden Lane Playground Refurbishment Project.

27. ELECTRONIC SOCIAL CARE RECORDING SYSTEM - GATEWAY 5 AUTHORITY TO START WORK

The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services which sought approval to commence works on the Electronic Social Care Recording System project.

28. HOLLOWAY ELECTRICS - UPDATE - ISSUE REPORT (GATEWAY 5)

The Sub-Committee noted a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services which advised of the issues which had been encountered and lessons learnt to date from the Holloway Electrics project.

29. 29A BROOK STREET - EXTERNAL & INTERNAL REPAIRS - CITY'S ESTATE - GATEWAY 2 PROJECT PROPOSAL

The Sub-Committee considered and delegated authority to the Town Clerk to approve a report of the City Surveyor which proposed a project to undertake external and internal repairs to 29a Brook Street, a City's Estate investment property.

30. WEST HAM PARK NURSERY PROJECT - GATEWAY 3 OUTLINE OPTIONS APPRAISAL

The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the Director of Open Spaces which sought approval to develop options for the project to explore the future uses of the West Ham Park Nursery.

31. **CITY OF LONDON PRIMARY ACADEMY - SOUTHWARK - ISSUE REPORT (GATEWAY 4)**
The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the City Surveyor which sought approval for further expenditure in relation to the City of London Primary Academy Southwark Project.
32. **4-14 TABERNACLE STREET - ISSUE REPORT (GATEWAY 5)**
The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the City Surveyor which sought approval to appoint an independent expert in relation to the 4-14 Tabernacle Street project.
33. **SUPERFAST CITY PROGRAMME UPDATE - ISSUE REPORT (GATEWAY 5)**
The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the City Surveyor which sought approval for an increased budget for the Superfast City project.
34. **ST LAWRENCE JEWRY CHURCH - GATEWAY 3/4 OPTIONS APPRAISAL**
The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the City Surveyor which set out the options and sought approval to develop the preferred option for the project for repairs to St Lawrence Jewry Church.
35. **GUILDHALL GREAT HALL STONEMWORK DEFECT - GATEWAY 3/4/5 OPTIONS APPRAISAL (REGULAR)**
The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the City Surveyor which set out the options, sought approval to develop the preferred option and authority to start work on the project to repair a stonework defect at the Guildhall.
36. **RISK TREATMENT PLAN - GATEWAY 2-5 AUTHORITY TO START WORK**
The Sub-Committee considered and approved a report of the Chamberlain which proposed and sought authority to start work on a project to undertake a Risk Treatment Plan of the City Corporation's security infrastructure.
37. **BUILDINGS PROGRAMME (INCLUDING HOUSING PROJECTS) - RED AND AMBER PROJECTS UPDATE REPORT**
The Sub-Committee noted a report of the City Surveyor which provided an update of the projects which were being undertaken as part of the Buildings Programme (including Housing projects).
38. **BARBICAN CAMPUS PROGRAMME**
The Sub-Committee noted a report of the Managing Director, Barbican Centre which provided an update of the projects which were being undertaken by the Barbican Centre.
39. **ACTION TAKEN BY THE TOWN CLERK UNDER DELEGATED AUTHORITY OR URGENCY PROCEDURES**
The Sub-Committee noted a report of the Town Clerk which provided information of action taken under delegated authority or urgency procedures since the last meeting.

40. QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE

There were no questions.

41. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREE SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED

There was one item of urgent business.

The meeting closed at 2.50pm.

Chairman

Contact Officer: Chris Braithwaite

tel.no.: 020 7332 1427

christopher.braithwaite@cityoflondon.gov.uk